

The Effectiveness of Cognitive Behavior Therapy Group Conseling Cognitive with Cognitive Restructuring and Thought Stopping Techniques to Reduce Students Consumptive Behavior

Ida Yuliyawati^{1✉}, Mungin Eddy Wibowo² & Muhammad Jafar³

¹ Universitas PGRI Semarang, Indonesia

² Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

³ Universitas Muhammadiyah Magelang, Indonesia

Article Info

History Articles

Received:

August 2018

Accepted:

September 2018

Published:

December 2018

Keywords:

*cognitive restructuring,
cognitive therapy behavior,
consumptive behavior,
group conseling,
thought stopping*

DOI

<https://doi.org/10.15294/jubk.v7i2.25689>

Abstract

This study aimed to determine the effectiveness of cognitive behavior therapy group counseling with cognitive restructuring and thought stopping techniques to reduce students' consumptive behavior. This experimental study used a pretest posttest group design by involving 14 students of Vocational High School (SMK) Bhakti Nusantara Boja as the members of cognitive restructuring technique group (7 students) and thought stopping technique group (7 students). The results of data analysis using Wilcoxon and Mann-Whitney tests showed that cognitive behavior therapy group counseling with cognitive restructuring and thought stopping techniques was effective in reducing students' consumptive behavior. The discussion of the results of this study was directed to reinforce the effectiveness of cognitive behavior therapy group counseling with cognitive restructuring and thought stopping techniques to reduce students' consumptive behavior.

© 2018 Universitas Negeri Semarang

✉ Correspondence address:

Sidodadi Timur No 24, Dr. Cipto Semarang, Jawa Tengah, 50125

E-mail: gendhishening28@gmail.com

[p-ISSN 2252-6889](#)

[e-ISSN 2502-4450](#)

INTRODUCTION

The advancement of information systems makes everyone easy to promote and access various new interesting products. Teenagers as individuals who are susceptible to being influenced by the environment are currently influenced by consumptive behavior, trying to fulfill the desire to have luxury goods that flood the Indonesian market both in the city and in the village. Consumptive attitudes that arise without any barrier or filtration will become a lifestyle, habits and eventually become a culture called the consumptive culture in the teenager environment (Fitri & Nursalim, 2013).

Shohibullana (2014) describes the definition of consumptive behavior as an action that is directly involved in implementing, consuming, spending products or services including the decision process that precedes and follows this action. Therefore, basically consumptive behavior is not only limited to a desire or action, but also includes various processes that follow the action.

In responding to today's rife consumptive behavior, teenagers, especially among high schools, should be able to limit the desire to use or consume things that are not needed excessively in order to avoid the emergence of consumptive behavior within. Consumptive behavior in teenagers must be limited considering that teenagers, especially high school students do not have their own income. If this happens in teenagers and even has become a lifestyle, it will affect the behavior of teenagers themselves even more so on the stability of the family economy, particularly for parents (Fitri & Nursalim, 2013).

The life of high school students has experienced many changes in the development of technology and information, especially in the school environment. It can be seen that the majority of school functions today are no longer a place to gain knowledge but as a place to show off performances among students. Research conducted by Sipunga & Muhammad (2014) explains that not a few of today's teenagers have more than 2 gadgets coming from various well-known gadget brands in Indonesia. As a result

high school students will be considered to follow developments when they have bought and used such goods. This phenomenon is believed to be able to uplift the social status of teenagers among their peers. Also, it can be judged based on their belongings, the style of dress, and the amount of money they spend.

By looking at this phenomenon, counseling services that can be used to help counselees in reducing consumptive behavior are by using a cognitive behavioral therapy (CBT) approach. CBT counseling assumes that individual overt behavior is influenced by cognitive processes. This approach does not only focus on changes in behavior, but more on the existence of cognitive distortions on individuals to solve problems (Corey, 2012). In addition Cognitive behavioral therapy is based on the principle that the mind is one of the causes of the formation of one's feelings and behavior (Jacobs, et al. 2011). This approach has also been adapted for patients with varying levels of education and income as well as various cultures and ages, from children to adults and older people. It is currently used also in treatment centers and medical offices, vocational school programs and prisons in various other settings. Moreover, this approach of counseling is used in groups, couples, and family formats (Beck, 2011).

In the intervention process, the technique used is cognitive restructuring and thought stopping. Cognitive restructuring is a procedure that tries to reshape cognitive patterns, assumptions, beliefs and judgments that are irrational, destructive and self-defeating. It does not only help the counselee learn to recognize and stop unrealistic thoughts, but also replaces unrealistic thoughts to be accurately realistic (Nursalim, 2007).

Cognitive restructuring has been used for the past several years to deal with cognitive impairment. One of which is consumptive behavior in teenagers. However, the effect of the cognitive restructuring does not improve the achievements made using the more traditional long-term approach commonly used by Batkoska, L., & Koseska, E. (2012). Cognitive restructuring has also been showed to be effective in reducing

the feeling of contamination in adults which is a burden when seeing items that tend to be sold at an incline (Longabaugh & Morgenstern, 1999). In addition, a research conducted by Erfantinni, et al. (2016) research discusses the counseling of CBT groups on cognitive restructuring techniques to reduce academic procrastination. The purpose of this study was to examine the effectiveness of the CBT group counseling cognitive restructuring techniques to reduce academic procrastination in terms of gender in students of SMK PGRI 2 Ponorogo. Randomized pretest-posttest control group design study was applied in this study by involving 16 students who had a high academic procrastination score. The data analysis technique used was non-parametric statistics by using Whitney's test to test the cognitive effects of restructuring on procrastination and Wilcoxon signed rank test to determine the effectiveness of interventions between the sexes of men and women. The results of this study indicate that CBT group counseling with cognitive restructuring techniques is effective to reduce academic procrastination. This technique was found suitable for male and female students. This is proven by the significant difference in posttest scores between the two.

Meanwhile, thought stopping technique refers to a group of procedures used to increase a person's ability to block cognitively a series of responses (Bakker, 2009). Through the use of this technique, the client will get rid of any unwanted thoughts as early as possible usually by calling "stop" commands to interrupt unwanted thoughts (Davis, et al. 2009).

Thought stopping was also used as a procedure for handling for a woman with an obsession to continue to look perfect that the woman kept doing quite alarming consumptive behavior as an effort to perfect her appearance (Platania, et al. 2016). During four sessions in a period of 27 days, the obsessive mind decreased from every 20 seconds to 2 hours during work and once every 30 minutes while not working. Several studies have successfully reported the effects of thought stopping techniques. Pourdoun & Clark (2007) report the results of their research that this technique is able to suppress obsessional negative

thinking such as shopping for new items that are trending to be a more rational thought with a variety of healthy considerations. Also, Rostiana, et al. (2018) study examined the effectiveness of group counseling by using self-instruction and thought stopping techniques to improve the self-esteem of students who were victims of bullying in the Seventh Grade level of Islamic Junior High School (MTs) Al Hikmah Proto Kedungwuni Pekalongan. The research method used was experimental with pretest-posttest random control group design by involving 21 subjects purposively. The results showed that self-instruction and thought stopping techniques were effective to improve students' self-esteem of victims of bullying.

Based on several studies above, these cognitive restructuring and thought stopping technique were hypothesized to be able to reduce the consumptive behavior of high school students. In addition, the techniques selection arose based on a study assuming that in order to reduce the consumptive behavior of high school students, there is a need to apply a special approach that can open up and fix the mindset of students by which these changes in mindset will have an impact on changes in behavior.

In general, this study aimed to determine the differences in the effectiveness of cognitive restructuring and thought stopping techniques in group counseling towards consumptive behavior in SMK Bhakti Nusantara Boja. Meanwhile, specifically this study was aimed at (1) Determining the effectiveness of cognitive behavior therapy group counseling with cognitive restructuring technique to reduce students' consumptive behavior in SMK Bhakti Nusantara Boja, (2) Knowing the effectiveness of cognitive behavior therapy group counseling with thought stopping technique to reduce students' consumptive behavior in SMK Bhakti Nusantara Boja, (3) Knowing the difference in the effectiveness of cognitive behavior therapy group counseling with cognitive restructuring and thought stopping techniques to reduce students' consumptive behavior in SMK Bhakti Nusantara Boja.

METHODS

This study used a quantitative approach with experimental methods. The study design used was pretest-posttest group design which further be divided into two groups, namely cognitive restructuring (group A) and thought stopping (group B) technique groups. Before being given treatment to each group, first the subjects of the study were given a pretest in the form of giving a consumptive behavior scale which was then the result of the pretest which became the basis for providing treatment to the research subjects. Furthermore, the intervention phases were conducted by asking each participant to take part in 6 group counseling sessions which included: group formation (session 1), rational strategy and knowing the cause and effect of the problem (session 2), identifying the counselee's negative thoughts (session 3), transitioning from negative thoughts who blame themselves for positive thoughts (session 4), practice self-statements to assertive thoughts (session 5), homework assignments and follow-up (session 6).

Purposive sampling technique was used to capture 14 students with a high level of consumptive behavior to be used as research subjects. The subjects selected in this study were divided into two groups, namely group A (cognitive restructuring technique) which consisted of 7 students and group B (thought stopping technique) totaling 7 students.

The data collection techniques in this study used a consumptive behavior scale instrument consisting of 35 items. After validating the instrument, 32 valid items were obtained with an Alpha coefficient of 0.755. In addition, the data analysis techniques used were Wilcoxon test and Mann-Whitney test.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Table 1 shows that the research subjects in group A (cognitive restructuring technique) obtained an average value of 92.14 and in group B (thought stopping technique) obtained an average value of 92.67. After group A and group

B were given treatments, the posttest results obtained an average value of 56.14 for group A (cognitive restructuring technique) and the average posttest group B results (thought stopping technique) 58.14. Thus, based on the condition before and after receiving treatments, it can be seen that there has been a decrease in the level of consumptive behavior tendency. This can be seen from the average value of each group decreasing from pretest to posttest.

Table 1. Wilcoxon and Mann-Whitney Analysis Test Results

Measurements	Test Results		
	Group A (N=7)	Group B (N=7)	
Pre-test	M	92.14	92.67
	SD	2.54	3.90
Post-test	M	56.14	58.14
	SD	10.6	8.49
Z ¹		-2.371	-2.371
p ¹		< 0.05	< 0.05
Z ²			-0.320
p ²			.749

Notes:

Z¹ = Wilcoxon

Z² Test Results = Mann-Whitney Test Results

The results of Wilcoxon analysis showed that in group A counseling (cognitive restructuring technique) and group B (thought stopping technique) both showed that both group counseling with cognitive restructuring techniques and thought stopping techniques were effective to reducing students' consumptive behavior (z= - 2.371, p < 0.05).

Meanwhile, the results of the Mann-Whitney test showed that there was no difference between group A counseling (cognitive restructuring technique) and group B counseling (thought stopping technique) in reducing students' consumptive behavior.

The purpose of this effectiveness test was to obtain an overview of the extent to which the cognitive behavior therapy group counseling intervention with cognitive restructuring and thought stopping techniques effective to reduce students' consumptive behavior. From the results of this study, it was found that cognitive behavior therapy group counselling with cognitive restructuring and thought stopping techniques was effective to reduce students' consumptive behavior in SMK Bhakti Nusantara Boja.

Based on the observations during the intervention, in general the treatments went smoothly. It was proven that there was a change in the level of consumptive behavior between before and after being given cognitive behavior therapy group counselling with cognitive restructuring and thought stopping techniques which was conducted 6 times. In the first experimental group, both in group A (cognitive restructuring technique) and group B (thought stopping technique) focused on seeing the cause and effect by finding out why consumer behavior occurred. From the results of the study, it was known that students experiencing consumer behavior were caused by being tempted by the lure of gifts or discounts and also following friends.

The cognitive behavior therapy group counselling with cognitive technique was effective in reducing students' consumptive behavior because this technique was in the form of procedures that tried to reshape cognitive patterns, assumptions, beliefs and irrational judgments, destructive and self-defeating. Cognitive restructuring not only helped counselees learn to recognize and stopped unrealistic thoughts, but also replaced unrealistic thoughts to be accurately realistic (Nursalim, et al. 2007).

Supporting the above statement, a research conducted by Dombeck & Wells-Moran (2014) explains that the use of cognitive restructuring will help to achieve a better emotional response by changing habitual assessment habits in such a way. As a result, one will not get used to it. Clients who have consumptive behavior will be invited by counselors to realize the negative impact of their behavior. In addition, a research conducted by Johnco, et al. (2014), discusses how cognitive restructuring allows professional counselors and counselees to collaboratively recognize irrational/maladaptive thoughts by using strategies such as logical disputation, socratic questioning, and behavioral experiments to enhance their realistic mind so that consumers' behavior can be suppressed. Therefore, by giving the treatment, the counselees can control himself

not to behave consumptively and allow to reduce the consumptive behavior carried out.

In addition to cognitive restructuring technique, the researchers also used thought stopping technique to be applied in helping students overcome the consumptive behavior they experienced. Broadly speaking, the effectiveness test carried out by researchers obtained an overview of the extent to which cognitive behavior therapy group counselling with thought stopping technique was able to reduce the consumptive behavior of students in SMK Bhakti Nusantara Boja. For more, the implementation of group counseling in this study aimed to help students to reduce the consumptive behavior they experienced.

The cognitive behavior therapy group counselling with thought stopping technique as a treatment in this study was conducted as many as 6 meetings by following the stages in thought stopping techniques. The results showed a significant decrease in the level of consumptive behavior between before and after being given cognitive behavior therapy group counselling with thought stopping technique. The focus of this study was through the use of this technique, clients would get rid of any unwanted thoughts as early as possible, usually by calling "stop" command to interrupt unwanted thoughts (Erford, 2016). Not only that, this technique can also be given in the form of punishment in order to reduce the possibility that the mind will reappear.

In line with the above statement, a research conducted by Bakker (2009) provides a very good analysis of the use of thought stopping inherent in the CBT therapy process showing that this technique is one of the specific and special form of mind supervision techniques that is very effective and increase coping client. Therefore, it can help clients to stop negative behavior, especially for consumptive behavior. Pourdon & Clark (2007) report the results of their research that this thought stopping technique is able to suppress obsession-negative thinking such as shopping for new items that were trending, becoming a more rational thought with a variety of healthy considerations. Thus, by being given

this treatment counselee can limit their selves in doing something especially related to consumptive behavior.

CONCLUSION

The cognitive behavior therapy group counselling with cognitive restructuring and thought stopping techniques is effective to reduce students' consumptive behavior. Furthermore, it is important for school counselors to pay more attention to the development of students in personal, social, career and learning fields, especially those related to consumptive behavior. This needs to be done so that the guidance and counseling teachers or counselors are able to provide counseling services not as a curative step but it is better done as a preventive measure so that the consumption behavior in school is not developed.

Future researchers are suggested to consider the use of a larger number of samples so that the results of the research findings on the effectiveness of cognitive behavior therapy group counselling with cognitive restructuring and thought stopping techniques to reduce consumptive behavior could be tested in a wider population.

REFERENCES

- Bakkker, G. M. (2009). In Defence of Thought Stopping. *Clinical Psychologist*, 13(2), 59-68. Retrieved from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13284200902810452>
- Batkoska, L., & Koseska, E. (2012). The Impact of Cognitive Learning on Consumer Behaviour. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 44, 70-77. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/257716134_The_Impact_of_Cognitive_Learning_on_Consumer_Behaviour
- Beck, J. S. (2011). *Cognitive Behavior Therapy (Basic and Beyond)*. New York: The Guilford Press a Division of Guilford Publications, Inc.
- Corey, G. (2012). *Theory and Practice of Group Counseling* 8th Edition. Belmont CA: Brooks/Cole.
- Davis, M., Robbins-Esheliman, G., & Makay, M. (2009). *The Relaxation and Stress Reduction Workbook* (6th edition). Oakland, CA: New Harbinger Publication.
- Dombeck, M. (2014). *Applying Learning Principles To Thought: Cognitive Restructuring*. Retrieved from <https://www.mentalhelp.net/articles/applying-learning-principles-to-thought-cognitive-restructuring>
- Erfantinni, I., Purwanto, E., & Japar, M. (2017). *Konseling Kelompok Cognitive-Behavior Therapy dengan Teknik Cognitive Restructuring untuk Mereduksi Prokrastinasi Akademik*. *Jurnal Bimbingan Konseling*, 5(2), 119-125. Retrieved from <https://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/jubk/article/view/14029>
- Erford, B. T. (2016). *40 Teknik yang Harus Diketahui Setiap Konselor*. Yogyakarta. Pustaka Pelajar.
- Fitri, A. D & Nursalim, M. (2013). Penerapan Strategi Pengelolaan Diri untuk Mengurangi Perilaku Konsumtif pada Siswa SMA Kelas X-11 SMAN 15 Surabaya. *Jurnal BK UNESA*, 1(1), 26-36. Retrieved from <http://jurnalmahasiswa.unesa.ac.id/index.php/jurnal-bk-unesa/article/view/1930>
- Jacobs, E. E., Harvill, R. L., & Mason, R. L. (2011). *Group Counseling: Strategies and Skill*. Belmont, CA: Brooks/Cole.
- Johnco, C., Wuthrich, V.M., Rapee, R.M. (2014). The Influence of Cognitive Flexibility on Treatment Outcome and Cognitive Restructuring Skill Acquisition During Cognitive Behavioural Treatment for Anxiety and Depression in Older Adults: Results of A Pilot Study. *Behaviour Research and Therapy*, 57, 55-64. Retrieved from <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/82689418.pdf>
- Platania, M., Platania, S., & Santisi, G. (2016). Entertainment Marketing, Experiential Consumption and Consumer Behavior: The Determinant of Choice of Wine in The Store. *Wine Economics and Policy* 5, 87-95. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/309015833_Entertainment_marketing_experiential_consumption_and_consumer_behavior_The_determinant_of_choice_of_wine_in_the_store
- Longabaugh, R & Morgenstern, J. (1999). Cognitive-Behavioral Coping-Skills Therapy for Alcohol Dependence. *Alcohol Research & Health*, 23(2): 78-85. Retrieved from

- <https://pubs.niaaa.nih.gov/publications/arh2-3-2/078-85.pdf>
- Nursalim, M. (2007). *Strategi Konseling*. Surabaya: UNESA University Press.
- Pourdon, J & Clark, D. (2007). *Counseling and Psychotherapy: Theories and Intervention*. New Jersey: Martial Prentice Hall.
- Rostiana, D., Wibowo, M., & Purwanto, E. (2018). The Implementation of Self Instruction and Thought Stopping Group Counseling Techniques to Improve Victim Bullying Self Esteem. *Jurnal Bimbingan Konseling*, 7(1), 36-40. Retrieved from <https://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/jubk/article/view/22439>
- Sipunga, P. N., & Muhammad, A H. (2014). Kecenderungan Perilaku Konsumtif Remaja di Tinjau dari Pendapatan Orang Tua pada Siswa-Siswi SMA Kesatrian 2 Semarang. *Journal of Social and Industrial Psychology*, 3(1), 62-68. Retrieved from <https://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/sip/article/view/3744>